



Mayor

Dee Margo

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Alexsandra Annello

District 3

Cassandra Hernandez

District 4

Sam Morgan

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz Perez

District 7

Henry Rivera

District 8

Cissy Lizarraga

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS

CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET

AUGUST 6, 2018, 4:00 P.M.

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, August 6, 2018, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman D.J. Sevigny

Vice-Chairman Sam Trimble

Commissioner Sherri Mowles

Commissioner Charles Stapler

Commissioner Kelly Blough

Commissioner Don Luciano

Commissioner Fred Morales

The following commissioner was not present:

Commissioner Vicki Hamilton

Vacancy:

District 1

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development

Mr. Russell Abeln, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Sevigny called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Chairman Sevigny asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. *No response from the audience.*

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Ms. Velázquez noted the following changes:

1. Item 1 postponed to the August 20th meeting; and
2. Item 3 was withdrawn.



Postponed to August 20th meeting

- 1. PHAP18-00032** 128 Government Hill w ½ of 14 to 18 (8729 sq. ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 4711 Chesterfield Avenue
Historic District: Austin Terrace
Property Owner: Travis and Celeste Diaz
Representative: Flor Isela Lujan
Representative District: 2
Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1940
Historic Status: Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition

Application Filed: 07/27/18
45 Day Expiration: 9/10/18

- 2. PHAP18-00033** 28 Sunset Heights 23 & E. 8 ft. of 22, (3960 sq. ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 806 Upson Drive
Historic District: Sunset Heights
Property Owner: Hurlburt Construction
Representative: Neal McMillan
Representative District: 8
Existing Zoning: R-5/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1930
Historic Status: Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition, demolition of existing dormers and construction of new dormers, chimney removal, construction of a garage, re-roofing, painting, and landscaping

Application Filed: 7/27/18
45 Day Expiration: 9/10/18



Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from commissioners. She pointed out she did recommend that these additions, with the exception of the dormers, be somehow located to the rear. Per the Guidelines and the Standards, there is no language approving these dormers in any way. She strongly recommended a different approach to this rather than the severe alteration. While the adjacent properties do have dormers, those dormers are to scale; however, the proposed dormers are not.



806 Upson.pptx

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *The way a building is situated on its site is very important to maintaining historic integrity within the site itself and the district's historic fabric. All new construction (including detached infill and additions to existing structures) should preserve and enhance the streetscape by appropriately addressing the elements of the historic streetscape. This does not mean that the new structure should appear historic but it should appear aesthetically and architecturally compatible and reinforce the historic properties of the adjacent buildings.*
- *New additions should be designed and constructed so that the character-defining features of the historic building are not radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed in the process of rehabilitation.*
- *Any new addition should be planning so that it is constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation and is minimally visible from the public right of way.*
- *Introduce additions in locations that are not visible from the street-generally on rear elevations.*
- *Locate additions carefully so they do not damage or conceal significant building features or details.*
- *It is not appropriate to introduce an addition if it requires the removal of character-defining building features such as patios, mature vegetation or a detached structure.*
- *Design an addition so it is compatible in roof form, proportions, materials and details with the existing structure.*
- *Design an addition that is compatible with but subtly different from existing historic homes in the district.*
- *Design an addition so that if removed in the future, the historic building's form and character defining features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.*



- *Architectural elements such as walls, porches, dormers, windows and doors should maintain the pattern and rhythm of the existing buildings.*
- *The distinctive features of each roof type should be retained as they are character-defining elements. If a roof requires repair, the replacement materials must match the original or existing materials as closely as possible. Do not change the style or construction of the roof.*
- *Existing chimneys and vents should be maintained. If repair is required, the original materials, style, color, and construction should be matched. New construction should not cause the removal of these historic elements.*
- *Design new garages and outbuildings to be compatible with the main structure on the lot in material and design, using existing historic outbuildings in the districts as an example.*
- *Limit the size and scale of garages and accessory structures so that the integrity of the original structure, or the size of the existing lot, is not compromised or significantly diminished.*
- *New garages and accessory buildings should be located in rear yards.*
- *Neutral tones and muted earth colors are strongly recommended for the main body of the structure. Trim color may be a darker or contrasting color than the body of the building. Paint colors must be of the period, times, architectural style of the building, and geographic location because that works for a color palette for a home in California does not necessarily fit with paint colors in El Paso.*
- *Repaint previously painted surfaces with compatible paint.*
- *When repainting, select paint colors that are compatible with the historic building and district. Enhance the features of a building through appropriate selection and placement of paint color consistent with its architectural style.*
- *Grass and sod may be removed from parkways provided not more than 50% of the area is covered with gravel or other masonry that is made of impervious materials (brick pavers, gravel, and masonry pavers). The remaining 50% must be covered with trees and/or living plants that provide ground cover. Any hardscape must be pervious and laid directly on the soil or on pervious fabric to allow water penetration.*



The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*
- *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historic development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*
- *Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*
- *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*
- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

THE MODIFICATIONS ARE:

- 1. THAT ELEVATIONS OF THE PROPOSED REAR FAÇADE AND WEST FAÇADES BE SUBMITTED TO THE HLC FOR REVIEW AND APPROVAL;**
- 2. THAT THE ADDITIONAL DORMERS ON THE MAIN STRUCTURE BE REMOVED FROM THE PROPOSAL;**
- 3. THAT THE CHIMNEYS REMAIN; AND**
- 4. THAT THE PARKWAY HAVE NO MORE THAN 50% HARDSCAPE AND 50% LIVE GROUND COVER.**

Neal McMillan, representing Hurlburt Construction, responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

After lengthy discussion, Commissioners moved to postpone the item to the August 20th meeting.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Stapler, seconded by Commissioner Luciano **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO POSTPONE.**



Chairman Sevigny requested the following amendments to the motion:

1. Maintaining the chimneys;
2. Making the dormers more proportionate to the home. One example is making them narrower, in all angles.
3. Revisiting the rear of the home to give it a second look for additions.

AMENDED MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Stapler, seconded by Commissioner Luciano ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO POSTPONE TO THE AUGUST 20TH MEETING WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENTS:***

1. Maintaining the chimneys;
2. Making the dormers more proportionate to the home. One example is making them narrower, in all angles.
3. Revisiting the rear of the home to give it a second look for additions.

APPLICATION WAS WITHDRAWN.

3. **PHAP18-00034** Blk. 1 Wall Estates Replat A Lot 3, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 10772 Socorro Road
- Historic District: Mission Trail
- Property Owner: Bobby Ray Wall
- Representative: Steve Geist
- Representative District: 6
- Existing Zoning: NA
- Year Built: NA
- Historic Status: Non-contributing
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a telecommunications tower, chain link fence, and driveway
- Application Filed: 07/27/18
- 45 Day Expiration: 9/10/18



4. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. August 6, 2018 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled at the August 20, 2018 meeting. August 20, 2018 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the September 10, 2018 meeting.

No address requests from commissioners.

HLC Staff Report

5. Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A.")

No comments from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Stapler **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THESE REVIEWS AS STATED.**

Other Business – Discussion and Action

6. Discussion and action on Regular meeting minutes for July 16, 2018.



07.16.2018 hlc
meeting minutes.pdf

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Luciano **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THESE MINUTES AS STATED.**

***ABSTAIN: Vice-Chairman Trimble
Commissioner Stapler
Commissioner Morales***



7. Discussion and action on the amendments to Chapter 20.20 of the El Paso City Code.

Ms. Velázquez explained amending Chapter 20.20 was half of the work. The following are what will be happening:

The first revision, removing the portion of the ordinance which states that properties on the National Register have to go through the same process as locally designated properties, will come before the City Council for the second reading which will be held at the August 21st City Council meeting. The City Council will take a vote. Ms. Velázquez stated she did not expect any opposition.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 5:02 P.M.***